



**M E M O**

22999 Forbes Road, Suite B • Cleveland, Ohio 44146-5667 • Phone: 440.439.1999 • Fax: 440.439.1969 • www.cvelimited.com

To: **Ryan Cummins, P.E.**

From: Scott Wood, P.E.

Date: April 2, 2019

Project Number: 19095

Regarding: Parkview Drive Pavement Resurfacing Project  
Bid Results and Recommendation

Please find enclosed a Bid Tabulation for the bids received on March 28, 2019 for the Parkview Drive Pavement Resurfacing Project. A total of (7) bids were submitted and opened at the City of Avon - City Hall. Bids ranged from a low bid of \$271,767 to a high bid of \$317,095.

The Engineers Estimate for the project was \$287,490. The low bid of \$271,767 as received from Crossroads Asphalt Recycling, Inc. is approximately 5.47% below the Engineers Estimate for the project.

Summary of Bid Totals

| Contractor                         | Bid Total    |
|------------------------------------|--------------|
| CROSSROADS ASPHALT RECYCLING, INC. | \$271,767.00 |
| CARRON ASPHALT PAVING, INC         | \$279,774.00 |
| RONYAK PAVING, INC.                | \$288,988.00 |
| BARBICAS CONSTRUCTION CO., INC.    | \$307,827.00 |
| CHAGRIN VALLEY PAVING, INC         | \$309,206.00 |
| PRECISION PAVING, INC.             | \$310,112.00 |
| SPECIALIZED CONSTRUCTION, INC.     | \$317,095.00 |

The bid as submitted by Crossroads Asphalt Recycling, Inc. has been reviewed and found to be in conformance with the requirements of the Contract Documents. Therefore, it is our recommendation to the City of Avon - City Council that Crossroads Asphalt Recycling, Inc. is the lowest and best bid for the Parkview Drive Pavement Resurfacing Project.

Cc: Michael Farmer, City of Avon, Service Director  
John Gasior, City of Avon, Law Director  
Bill Logan, City of Avon, Finance Director

## BIDDER'S CHECKLIST

### Parkview Drive Pavement Resurfacing Project

Bid Opening Date March 28, 2019

Avon, Ohio

| Bid Components   | Cross Roads Asphalt Recycling, Inc | Carron Asphalt Paving, Inc | Ronyak Paving, Inc |
|--|------------------------------------|----------------------------|--------------------|
| Proposal - Completed and Signed                            | Yes                                | Yes                        | Yes                |
| Bid Bond or Check - Submitted with Bid                     | Yes - Bid Bond                     | Yes - Bid Bond             | Yes - Bid Bond     |
| Bidder's Qualification Statement – Completed with Bid      | Yes                                | Yes                        | Yes                |
| Non-Collusion Affidavit – Completed with Bid               | Yes                                | Yes                        | Yes                |
| Personal Property Tax Statement – Complete with Bid        | Yes                                | Yes                        | Yes                |
| Certifications for Finding of Recovery – Complete with Bid | Yes                                | Yes                        | Yes                |
| Verification of Bid Total                                  | Yes                                | Yes                        | Yes                |

**BID TABULATION  
PARKVIEW DRIVE PAVEMENT RESURFACING PROJECT  
CITY OF AVON**

**CVE JOB NO. 19095 DATE: MARCH 28, 2019  
ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE: \$287,490.00**

|                           |   | CROSSROADS ASPHALT RECYCLING, INC. |       |             |                                | CARRON ASPHALT PAVING, INC.       |              |                     |                     |
|---------------------------|---|------------------------------------|-------|-------------|--------------------------------|-----------------------------------|--------------|---------------------|---------------------|
|                           | DESCRIPTION   | UNIT                               | QTY.  | UNIT PRICE  | TOTAL PRICE                    | UNIT PRICE                        | TOTAL PRICE  | UNIT PRICE          | TOTAL PRICE         |
| 1                         | PARTIAL DEPTH PAVEMENT REPAIR                                 | SY                                 | 546   | \$32.00     | \$17,472.00                    | \$32.00                           | \$17,472.00  | \$32.00             | \$17,472.00         |
| 2                         | PAVEMENT PLANING, PORTLAND CEMENT CONCRETE                    | SY                                 | 3,640 | \$5.00      | \$18,200.00                    | \$6.00                            | \$21,840.00  | \$6.00              | \$21,840.00         |
| 3                         | CONCRETE PAVEMENT REMOVAL AND RIGID REPLACEMENT, CLASS QC MS  | SY                                 | 910   | \$90.00     | \$81,900.00                    | \$90.00                           | \$81,900.00  | \$90.00             | \$81,900.00         |
| 4                         | SUBGRADE REMOVAL AND REPLACEMENT                              | CY                                 | 305   | \$50.00     | \$15,250.00                    | \$50.00                           | \$15,250.00  | \$50.00             | \$15,250.00         |
| 5                         | SINGLE CHIP SEAL, TYPE A                                      | SY                                 | 3,640 | \$2.00      | \$7,280.00                     | \$2.40                            | \$8,736.00   | \$2.40              | \$8,736.00          |
| 6                         | ASPHALT CONCRETE SURFACE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22      | CY                                 | 155   | \$215.00    | \$33,325.00                    | \$230.00                          | \$35,650.00  | \$230.00            | \$35,650.00         |
| 7                         | ASPHALT CONCRETE INTERMEDIATE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22 | CY                                 | 105   | \$185.00    | \$19,425.00                    | \$190.00                          | \$19,950.00  | \$190.00            | \$19,950.00         |
| 8                         | ASPHALT PAVEMENT SURFACE TREATMENT                            | SY                                 | 3,640 | \$1.00      | \$3,640.00                     | \$0.90                            | \$3,276.00   | \$0.90              | \$3,276.00          |
| 9                         | WALK REMOVED AND REPLACED WITH CONCRETE CURB RAMP             | SF                                 | 150   | \$20.00     | \$3,000.00                     | \$20.00                           | \$3,000.00   | \$20.00             | \$3,000.00          |
| 10                        | CONCRETE CURB REMOVED AND REPLACED                            | FT                                 | 60    | \$45.00     | \$2,700.00                     | \$45.00                           | \$2,700.00   | \$45.00             | \$2,700.00          |
| 11                        | REMOVE AND REPLACE CATCH BASIN                                | EACH                               | 2     | \$4,000.00  | \$8,000.00                     | \$4,000.00                        | \$8,000.00   | \$4,000.00          | \$8,000.00          |
| 12                        | CATCH BASIN RECONSTRUCTED TO GRADE                            | EACH                               | 7     | \$2,000.00  | \$14,000.00                    | \$2,000.00                        | \$14,000.00  | \$2,000.00          | \$14,000.00         |
| 13                        | STORM MANHOLE ADJUSTED TO GRADE                               | EACH                               | 1     | \$1,000.00  | \$1,000.00                     | \$1,000.00                        | \$1,000.00   | \$1,000.00          | \$1,000.00          |
| 14                        | MONUMENT BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE                                | EACH                               | 2     | \$500.00    | \$1,000.00                     | \$500.00                          | \$1,000.00   | \$500.00            | \$1,000.00          |
| 15                        | MISCELLANEOUS METAL   | LBS                                | 2,000 | \$1.50      | \$3,000.00                     | \$1.25                            | \$2,500.00   | \$1.25              | \$2,500.00          |
| 16                        | REMOVAL, REPLACEMENT AND RE-ERECTION OF GROUND MOUNTED SIGNS  | LUMP                               | 1     | \$250.00    | \$250.00                       | \$250.00                          | \$250.00     | \$1,000.00          | \$1,000.00          |
| 17                        | MAINTENANCE OF TRAFFIC  | LUMP                               | 1     | \$10,325.00 | \$10,325.00                    | \$10,325.00                       | \$10,325.00  | \$10,500.00         | \$10,500.00         |
| 18                        | GENERAL CONSTRUCTION CONTINGENCY ALLOWANCE                    | LUMP                               | 1     | \$15,000.00 | \$15,000.00                    | \$15,000.00                       | \$15,000.00  | \$15,000.00         | \$15,000.00         |
| 19                        | CONSTRUCTION STAKING ALLOWANCE                                | LUMP                               | 1     | \$2,000.00  | \$2,000.00                     | \$2,000.00                        | \$2,000.00   | \$2,000.00          | \$2,000.00          |
| 20                        | INSPECTION ALLOWANCE  | LUMP                               | 1     | \$15,000.00 | \$15,000.00                    | \$15,000.00                       | \$15,000.00  | \$15,000.00         | \$15,000.00         |
| <b>TOTAL PROJECT COST</b> |   |                                    |       |             | <b>TOTAL</b>                   | <b>\$271,767.00</b>               | <b>TOTAL</b> | <b>\$279,774.00</b> | <b>\$279,774.00</b> |
|                           |   |                                    |       |             | DAYS TO COMPLETE: 60 DAYS      | DAYS TO COMPLETE: 40 - 55         |              |                     |                     |
|                           |   |                                    |       |             | EARLIEST START DATE: 5/15/2019 | EARLIEST START DATE: JUNE 1, 2019 |              |                     |                     |

\* Math Error

\*\*Actual Bid Submitted \$279,999.00

|    |   | RONYAK PAVING, INC. |       |                                   | BARBICAS CONSTRUCTION CO., INC. |                                     |                     |
|----|---|---------------------|-------|-----------------------------------|---------------------------------|-------------------------------------|---------------------|
|    | DESCRIPTION   | UNIT                | QTY.  | UNIT PRICE                        | TOTAL PRICE                     | UNIT PRICE                          | TOTAL PRICE         |
| 1  | PARTIAL DEPTH PAVEMENT REPAIR                                 | SY                  | 546   | \$48.00                           | \$26,208.00                     | \$27.00                             | \$14,742.00         |
| 2  | PAVEMENT PLANING, PORTLAND CEMENT CONCRETE                    | SY                  | 3,640 | \$7.25                            | \$26,390.00                     | \$10.00                             | \$36,400.00         |
| 3  | CONCRETE PAVEMENT REMOVAL AND RIGID REPLACEMENT, CLASS QC MS  | SY                  | 910   | \$90.00                           | \$81,900.00                     | \$80.00                             | \$72,800.00         |
| 4  | SUBGRADE REMOVAL AND REPLACEMENT                              | CY                  | 305   | \$20.00                           | \$6,100.00                      | \$40.00                             | \$12,200.00         |
| 5  | SINGLE CHIP SEAL, TYPE A                                      | SY                  | 3,640 | \$2.00                            | \$7,280.00                      | \$3.00                              | \$10,920.00         |
| 6  | ASPHALT CONCRETE SURFACE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22      | CY                  | 155   | \$200.00                          | \$31,000.00                     | \$295.00                            | \$45,725.00         |
| 7  | ASPHALT CONCRETE INTERMEDIATE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22 | CY                  | 105   | \$190.00                          | \$19,950.00                     | \$270.00                            | \$28,350.00         |
| 8  | ASPHALT PAVEMENT SURFACE TREATMENT                            | SY                  | 3,640 | \$0.99                            | \$3,603.60                      | \$1.00                              | \$3,640.00          |
| 9  | WALK REMOVED AND REPLACED WITH CONCRETE CURB RAMP             | SF                  | 150   | \$14.00                           | \$2,100.00                      | \$15.00                             | \$2,250.00          |
| 10 | CONCRETE CURB REMOVED AND REPLACED                            | FT                  | 60    | \$40.00                           | \$2,400.00                      | \$40.00                             | \$2,400.00          |
| 11 | REMOVE AND REPLACE CATCH BASIN                                | EACH                | 2     | \$3,500.00                        | \$7,000.00                      | \$2,500.00                          | \$5,000.00          |
| 12 | CATCH BASIN RECONSTRUCTED TO GRADE                            | EACH                | 7     | \$1,250.00                        | \$8,750.00                      | \$1,500.00                          | \$10,500.00         |
| 13 | STORM MANHOLE ADJUSTED TO GRADE                               | EACH                | 1     | \$625.00                          | \$625.00                        | \$1,000.00                          | \$1,000.00          |
| 14 | MONUMENT BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE                                | EACH                | 2     | \$475.00                          | \$950.00                        | \$500.00                            | \$1,000.00          |
| 15 | MISCELLANEOUS METAL   | LBS                 | 2,000 | \$1.35                            | \$2,700.00                      | \$1.50                              | \$3,000.00          |
| 16 | REMOVAL, REPLACEMENT AND RE-ERECTION OF GROUND MOUNTED SIGNS  | LUMP                | 1     | \$900.00                          | \$900.00                        | \$900.00                            | \$900.00            |
| 17 | MAINTENANCE OF TRAFFIC  | LUMP                | 1     | \$29,131.40                       | \$29,131.40                     | \$25,000.00                         | \$25,000.00         |
| 18 | GENERAL CONSTRUCTION CONTINGENCY ALLOWANCE                    | LUMP                | 1     | \$15,000.00                       | \$15,000.00                     | \$15,000.00                         | \$15,000.00         |
| 19 | CONSTRUCTION STAKING ALLOWANCE                                | LUMP                | 1     | \$2,000.00                        | \$2,000.00                      | \$2,000.00                          | \$2,000.00          |
| 20 | INSPECTION ALLOWANCE  | LUMP                | 1     | \$15,000.00                       | \$15,000.00                     | \$15,000.00                         | \$15,000.00         |
|    |   |                     |       | <b>TOTAL</b>                      | <b>\$288,988.00</b>             | <b>TOTAL</b>                        | <b>\$307,827.00</b> |
|    |   |                     |       | DAYS TO COMPLETE: 45 DAYS         |                                 | DAYS TO COMPLETE: 45 DAYS           |                     |
|    |   |                     |       | EARLIEST START DATE: JUNE 3, 2019 |                                 | EARLIEST START DATE: APRIL 15, 2019 |                     |

|                           |   |      |       | CHAGRIN VALLEY PAVING, INC.         |                     |              | PRECISION PAVING, INC.             |            |             |
|---------------------------|---|------|-------|-------------------------------------|---------------------|--------------|------------------------------------|------------|-------------|
|                           | DESCRIPTION   | UNIT | QTY.  | UNIT PRICE                          | TOTAL PRICE         | UNIT PRICE   | TOTAL PRICE                        | UNIT PRICE | TOTAL PRICE |
| 1                         | PARTIAL DEPTH PAVEMENT REPAIR                                 | SY   | 546   | \$15.00                             | \$8,190.00          | \$36.00      | \$19,656.00                        |            |             |
| 2                         | PAVEMENT PLANING, PORTLAND CEMENT CONCRETE                    | SY   | 3,640 | \$4.00                              | \$14,560.00         | \$3.40       | \$12,376.00                        |            |             |
| 3                         | CONCRETE PAVEMENT REMOVAL AND RIGID REPLACEMENT, CLASS QC MS  | SY   | 910   | \$95.00                             | \$86,450.00         | \$123.00     | \$111,930.00                       |            |             |
| 4                         | SUBGRADE REMOVAL AND REPLACEMENT                              | CY   | 305   | \$40.00                             | \$12,200.00         | \$75.00      | \$22,875.00                        |            |             |
| 5                         | SINGLE CHIP SEAL, TYPE A                                      | SY   | 3,640 | \$3.15                              | \$11,466.00         | \$3.25       | \$11,830.00                        |            |             |
| 6                         | ASPHALT CONCRETE SURFACE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22      | CY   | 155   | \$250.00                            | \$38,750.00         | \$204.00     | \$31,620.00                        |            |             |
| 7                         | ASPHALT CONCRETE INTERMEDIATE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22 | CY   | 105   | \$250.00                            | \$26,250.00         | \$167.00     | \$17,535.00                        |            |             |
| 8                         | ASPHALT PAVEMENT SURFACE TREATMENT                            | SY   | 3,640 | \$1.00                              | \$3,640.00          | \$1.00       | \$3,640.00                         |            |             |
| 9                         | WALK REMOVED AND REPLACED WITH CONCRETE CURB RAMP             | SF   | 150   | \$25.00                             | \$3,750.00          | \$25.00      | \$3,750.00                         |            |             |
| 10                        | CONCRETE CURB REMOVED AND REPLACED                            | FT   | 60    | \$50.00                             | \$3,000.00          | \$75.00      | \$4,500.00                         |            |             |
| 11                        | REMOVE AND REPLACE CATCH BASIN                                | EACH | 2     | \$4,500.00                          | \$9,000.00          | \$4,000.00   | \$8,000.00                         |            |             |
| 12                        | CATCH BASIN RECONSTRUCTED TO GRADE                            | EACH | 7     | \$2,000.00                          | \$14,000.00         | \$2,000.00   | \$14,000.00                        |            |             |
| 13                        | STORM MANHOLE ADJUSTED TO GRADE                               | EACH | 1     | \$1,000.00                          | \$1,000.00          | \$1,200.00   | \$1,200.00                         |            |             |
| 14                        | MONUMENT BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE                                | EACH | 2     | \$600.00                            | \$1,200.00          | \$1,000.00   | \$2,000.00                         |            |             |
| 15                        | MISCELLANEOUS METAL   | LBS  | 2,000 | \$1.50                              | \$3,000.00          | \$1.10       | \$2,200.00                         |            |             |
| 16                        | REMOVAL, REPLACEMENT AND RE-ERECTION OF GROUND MOUNTED SIGNS  | LUMP | 1     | \$750.00                            | \$750.00            | \$1,000.00   | \$1,000.00                         |            |             |
| 17                        | MAINTENANCE OF TRAFFIC  | LUMP | 1     | \$40,000.00                         | \$40,000.00         | \$10,000.00  | \$10,000.00                        |            |             |
| 18                        | GENERAL CONSTRUCTION CONTINGENCY ALLOWANCE                    | LUMP | 1     | \$15,000.00                         | \$15,000.00         | \$15,000.00  | \$15,000.00                        |            |             |
| 19                        | CONSTRUCTION STAKING ALLOWANCE                                | LUMP | 1     | \$2,000.00                          | \$2,000.00          | \$2,000.00   | \$2,000.00                         |            |             |
| 20                        | INSPECTION ALLOWANCE  | LUMP | 1     | \$15,000.00                         | \$15,000.00         | \$15,000.00  | \$15,000.00                        |            |             |
| <b>TOTAL PROJECT COST</b> |   |      |       | <b>TOTAL</b>                        | <b>\$309,206.00</b> | <b>TOTAL</b> | <b>\$310,112.00</b>                |            |             |
|                           |   |      |       | DAYS TO COMPLETE: JULY 1, 2019      |                     |              | DAYS TO COMPLETE: 42 CALENDAR DAYS |            |             |
|                           |   |      |       | EARLIEST START DATE: APRIL 15, 2019 |                     |              | EARLIEST START DATE: MAY 20, 2019  |            |             |

|                                   |   |             |             |                   | <b>SPECIALIZED CONSTRUCTION,<br/>INC.</b> |                     |
|-----------------------------------|---|-------------|-------------|-------------------|---|---------------------|
|                                   | <b>DESCRIPTION</b>  | <b>UNIT</b> | <b>QTY.</b> | <b>UNIT PRICE</b> | <b>TOTAL PRICE</b>                        |                     |
| 1                                 | PARTIAL DEPTH PAVEMENT REPAIR                                 | SY          | 546         | \$65.00           | \$35,490.00                               |                     |
| 2                                 | PAVEMENT PLANING; PORTLAND CEMENT CONCRETE                    | SY          | 3,640       | \$7.00            | \$25,480.00                               |                     |
| 3                                 | CONCRETE PAVEMENT REMOVAL AND RIGID REPLACEMENT, CLASS QC MS  | SY          | 910         | \$90.00           | \$81,900.00                               |                     |
| 4                                 | SUBGRADE REMOVAL AND REPLACEMENT                              | CY          | 305         | \$50.00           | \$15,250.00                               |                     |
| 5                                 | SINGLE CHIP SEAL, TYPE A                                      | SY          | 3,640       | \$3.50            | \$12,740.00                               |                     |
| 6                                 | ASPHALT CONCRETE SURFACE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22      | CY          | 155         | \$225.00          | \$34,875.00                               |                     |
| 7                                 | ASPHALT CONCRETE INTERMEDIATE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22 | CY          | 105         | \$200.00          | \$21,000.00                               |                     |
| 8                                 | ASPHALT PAVEMENT SURFACE TREATMENT                            | SY          | 3,640       | \$1.50            | \$5,460.00                                |                     |
| 9                                 | WALK REMOVED AND REPLACED WITH CONCRETE CURB RAMP             | SF          | 150         | \$20.00           | \$3,000.00                                |                     |
| 10                                | CONCRETE CURB REMOVED AND REPLACED                            | FT          | 60          | \$45.00           | \$2,700.00                                |                     |
| 11                                | REMOVE AND REPLACE CATCH BASIN                                | EACH        | 2           | \$4,000.00        | \$8,000.00                                |                     |
| 12                                | CATCH BASIN RECONSTRUCTED TO GRADE                            | EACH        | 7           | \$2,000.00        | \$14,000.00                               |                     |
| 13                                | STORM MANHOLE ADJUSTED TO GRADE                               | EACH        | 1           | \$1,000.00        | \$1,000.00                                |                     |
| 14                                | MONUMENT BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE                                | EACH        | 2           | \$500.00          | \$1,000.00                                |                     |
| 15                                | MISCELLANEOUS METAL   | LBS         | 2,000       | \$1.50            | \$3,000.00                                |                     |
| 16                                | REMOVAL, REPLACEMENT AND RE-ERECTION OF GROUND MOUNTED SIGNS  | LUMP        | 1           | \$1,200.00        | \$1,200.00                                |                     |
| 17                                | MAINTENANCE OF TRAFFIC  | LUMP        | 1           | \$19,000.00       | \$19,000.00                               |                     |
| 18                                | GENERAL CONSTRUCTION CONTINGENCY ALLOWANCE                    | LUMP        | 1           | \$15,000.00       | \$15,000.00                               |                     |
| 19                                | CONSTRUCTION STAKING ALLOWANCE                                | LUMP        | 1           | \$2,000.00        | \$2,000.00                                |                     |
| 20                                | INSPECTION ALLOWANCE  | LUMP        | 1           | \$15,000.00       | \$15,000.00                               |                     |
| <b>TOTAL PROJECT COST</b>         |   |             |             |                   | <b>TOTAL</b>                              | <b>\$317,095.00</b> |
| DAYS TO COMPLETE: 45              |   |             |             |                   |   |                     |
| EARLIEST START DATE: MAY 31, 2019 |   |             |             |                   |   |                     |