



M E M O

22999 Forbes Road, Suite B • Cleveland, Ohio 44146-5667 • Phone: 440.439.1999 • Fax: 440.439.1969 • www.cvelimited.com

To: **Ryan Cummins, P.E.**

From: Scott Wood, P.E.

Date: April 2, 2019

Project Number: 19094

Regarding: Kinzel Road Pavement Resurfacing Project
Bid Results and Recommendation

Please find enclosed a Bid Tabulation for the bids received on March 28, 2019 for the Kinzel Road Pavement Resurfacing Project. A total of (7) bids were submitted and opened at the City of Avon - City Hall. Bids ranged from a low bid of \$357,099.40 to a high bid of \$492,338.

The Engineers Estimate for the project was \$351,975. The low bid of \$357,099.40 as received from Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc. is approximately 1.45% above the Engineers Estimate for the project.

Summary of Bid Totals

| Contractor | Bid Total |
|------------------------------------|--------------|
| CHAGRIN VALLEY PAVING, INC. | \$357,099.40 |
| CROSSROADS ASPHALT RECYCLING, INC. | \$361,133.65 |
| RONYAK PAVING, INC. | \$372,096.00 |
| PRECISION PAVING, INC. | \$386,626.75 |
| CARRON ASPHALT PAVING, INC. | \$403,115.25 |
| BARBICAS CONSTRUCTION CO., INC. | \$437,844.00 |
| SPECIALIZED CONSTRUCTION, INC. | \$492,338.00 |

The bid as submitted by Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc. has been reviewed and found to be in conformance with the requirements of the Contract Documents. Therefore, it is our recommendation to the City of Avon - City Council that Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc. is the lowest and best bid for the Kinzel Road Pavement Resurfacing Project.

Cc: Michael Farmer, City of Avon, Service Director
John Gasior, City of Avon, Law Director
Bill Logan, City of Avon, Finance Director

BIDDER'S CHECKLIST

Kinzel Road Pavement Resurfacing Project

Bid Opening Date March 28, 2019

Avon, Ohio

| Bid Components | Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc | Cross Roads Asphalt Recycling, Inc | Ronyak Paving, Inc |
|--|----------------------------|------------------------------------|--------------------|
| Proposal - Completed and Signed | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| Bid Bond or Check - Submitted with Bid | Yes - Bid Bond | Yes - Bid Bond | Yes - Bid Bond |
| Bidder's Qualification Statement – Completed with Bid | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| Non-Collusion Affidavit – Completed with Bid | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| Personal Property Tax Statement – Complete with Bid | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| Certifications for Finding of Recovery – Complete with Bid | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| Clarification No. 1 – Signed with Bid | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| Verification of Bid Total | Yes | Yes | Yes |

BID TABULATION
KINZEL ROAD PAVEMENT RESURFACING PROJECT
CITY OF AVON

CVE JOB NO. 19094 DATE: MARCH 28, 2019
ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE: \$351,975.00

| | | CHAGRIN VALLEY PAVING, INC. | | | CROSSROADS ASPHALT RECYCLING, INC. | | |
|---------------------------|---|-----------------------------|-------|-------------------------------------|------------------------------------|--------------|---------------------|
| | DESCRIPTION | UNIT | QTY. | UNIT PRICE | TOTAL PRICE | UNIT PRICE | TOTAL PRICE |
| 1 | LINEAR GRADING | LF | 4,711 | \$0.40 | \$1,884.40 | \$2.15 | \$10,128.65 |
| 2 | PARTIAL DEPTH ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPAIR | SY | 710 | \$15.00 | \$10,650.00 | \$19.50 | \$13,845.00 |
| 3 | CONCRETE DRIVE REMOVAL AND ASPHALT REPLACEMENT | SY | 125 | \$80.00 | \$10,000.00 | \$90.00 | \$11,250.00 |
| 4 | FULL DEPTH ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPAIR | SY | 1,425 | \$40.00 | \$57,000.00 | \$42.00 | \$59,850.00 |
| 5 | PAVEMENT PLANING, ASPHALT CONCRETE | SY | 7,120 | \$2.25 | \$16,020.00 | \$3.00 | \$21,360.00 |
| 6 | PAVEMENT PLANING, PORTLAND CEMENT CONCRETE | SY | 123 | \$5.00 | \$615.00 | \$10.00 | \$1,230.00 |
| 7 | SUBGRADE REMOVAL AND REPLACEMENT | CY | 475 | \$30.00 | \$14,250.00 | \$40.00 | \$19,000.00 |
| 8 | CONCRETE PAVEMENT REMOVAL AND REPAIR, CLASS QC MS | SY | 115 | \$145.00 | \$16,675.00 | \$110.00 | \$12,650.00 |
| 9 | ODOT 441, ASPHALT CONCRETE SURFACE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22 (2" DEPTH) | CY | 400 | \$175.00 | \$70,000.00 | \$195.00 | \$78,000.00 |
| 10 | ODOT 441, ASPHALT CONCRETE INTERMEDIATE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22 (3/4" LEVELING) | CY | 150 | \$200.00 | \$30,000.00 | \$180.00 | \$27,000.00 |
| 11 | WALK REMOVED AND REPLACED WITH CONCRETE CURB RAMP | SF | 200 | \$15.00 | \$3,000.00 | \$14.75 | \$2,950.00 |
| 12 | CONCRETE CURB REMOVED AND REPLACED (CONCRETE CURB, TYPE 3-A) | LF | 60 | \$50.00 | \$3,000.00 | \$42.00 | \$2,520.00 |
| 13 | MANHOLE ADJUST TO GRADE | EACH | 4 | \$500.00 | \$2,000.00 | \$660.00 | \$2,640.00 |
| 14 | VALVE BOX ADJUST TO GRADE | EACH | 4 | \$350.00 | \$1,400.00 | \$500.00 | \$2,000.00 |
| 15 | MAINTENANCE OF TRAFFIC | LUMP | 1 | \$54,000.00 | \$54,000.00 | \$29,350.00 | \$29,350.00 |
| 16 | SHOULDER PREPARATION | SY | 1,050 | \$1.00 | \$1,050.00 | \$3.00 | \$3,150.00 |
| 17 | COMPACTED AGGREGATE SHOULDER | CY | 175 | \$70.00 | \$12,250.00 | \$71.00 | \$12,425.00 |
| 18 | MONUMENT BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE | EACH | 3 | \$510.00 | \$1,530.00 | \$495.00 | \$1,485.00 |
| 19 | MISCELLANEOUS METALS | LBS | 500 | \$2.00 | \$1,000.00 | \$1.50 | \$750.00 |
| 20 | REMOVAL, REPLACEMENT AND RE-ERECTION OF GROUND MOUNTED SIGNS | LUMP | 1 | \$1,500.00 | \$1,500.00 | \$500.00 | \$500.00 |
| 21 | REMOVE AND REPLACE EXISTING LOOP DETECTORS | LUMP | 1 | \$1,500.00 | \$1,500.00 | \$3,000.00 | \$3,000.00 |
| 22 | PAVEMENT MARKINGS | LUMP | 1 | \$4,400.00 | \$4,400.00 | \$3,800.00 | \$3,800.00 |
| 23 | MAIL BOX SUPPORT SYSTEM, SINGLE | EACH | 45 | \$75.00 | \$3,375.00 | \$50.00 | \$2,250.00 |
| 24 | GENERAL CONSTRUCTION CONTINGENCY ALLOWANCE | LUMP | 1 | \$19,000.00 | \$19,000.00 | \$19,000.00 | \$19,000.00 |
| 25 | CONSTRUCTION STAKING ALLOWANCE | LUMP | 1 | \$3,000.00 | \$3,000.00 | \$3,000.00 | \$3,000.00 |
| 26 | INSPECTION ALLOWANCE | LUMP | 1 | \$18,000.00 | \$18,000.00 | \$18,000.00 | \$18,000.00 |
| TOTAL PROJECT COST | | | | TOTAL | \$357,099.40 | TOTAL | \$361,133.65 |
| | | | | DAYS TO COMPLETE: AUG 1, 2019 | DAYS TO COMPLETE: 60 DAYS | | |
| | | | | EARLIEST START DATE: APRIL 15, 2019 | EARLIEST START DATE: 5/15/2019 | | |

| | | RONYAK PAVING, INC. | | | | PRECISION PAVING, INC. | | | |
|---------------------------|---|---------------------|-------|-----------------------------------|---------------------|------------------------------------|---------------------|------------|-------------|
| | DESCRIPTION | UNIT | QTY. | UNIT PRICE | TOTAL PRICE | UNIT PRICE | TOTAL PRICE | UNIT PRICE | TOTAL PRICE |
| 1 | LINEAR GRADING | LF | 4,711 | \$5.00 | \$23,555.00 | \$2.00 | \$9,422.00 | | |
| 2 | PARTIAL DEPTH ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPAIR | SY | 710 | \$24.00 | \$17,040.00 | \$16.00 | \$11,360.00 | | |
| 3 | CONCRETE DRIVE REMOVAL AND ASPHALT REPLACEMENT | SY | 125 | \$125.00 | \$15,625.00 | \$48.00 | \$6,000.00 | | |
| 4 | FULL DEPTH ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPAIR | SY | 1,425 | \$40.00 | \$57,000.00 | \$54.00 | \$76,950.00 | | |
| 5 | PAVEMENT PLANING, ASPHALT CONCRETE | SY | 7,120 | \$3.00 | \$21,360.00 | \$2.35 | \$16,732.00 | | |
| 6 | PAVEMENT PLANING, PORTLAND CEMENT CONCRETE | SY | 123 | \$12.00 | \$1,476.00 | \$9.25 | \$1,137.75 | | |
| 7 | SUBGRADE REMOVAL AND REPLACEMENT | CY | 475 | \$25.00 | \$11,875.00 | \$72.00 | \$34,200.00 | | |
| 8 | CONCRETE PAVEMENT REMOVAL AND REPAIR, CLASS QC MS | SY | 115 | \$100.00 | \$11,500.00 | \$122.00 | \$14,030.00 | | |
| 9 | ODOT 441, ASPHALT CONCRETE SURFACE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22 (2" DEPTH) | CY | 400 | \$165.00 | \$66,000.00 | \$183.00 | \$73,200.00 | | |
| 10 | ODOT 441, ASPHALT CONCRETE INTERMEDIATE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22 (3/4" LEVELING) | CY | 150 | \$190.00 | \$28,500.00 | \$196.00 | \$29,400.00 | | |
| 11 | WALK REMOVED AND REPLACED WITH CONCRETE CURB RAMP | SF | 200 | \$12.50 | \$2,500.00 | \$25.00 | \$5,000.00 | | |
| 12 | CONCRETE CURB REMOVED AND REPLACED (CONCRETE CURB, TYPE 3-A) | LF | 60 | \$40.00 | \$2,400.00 | \$77.00 | \$4,620.00 | | |
| 13 | MANHOLE ADJUST TO GRADE | EACH | 4 | \$625.00 | \$2,500.00 | \$800.00 | \$3,200.00 | | |
| 14 | VALVE BOX ADJUST TO GRADE | EACH | 4 | \$450.00 | \$1,800.00 | \$600.00 | \$2,400.00 | | |
| 15 | MAINTENANCE OF TRAFFIC | LUMP | 1 | \$35,890.00 | \$35,890.00 | \$22,500.00 | \$22,500.00 | | |
| 16 | SHOULDER PREPARATION | SY | 1,050 | \$7.00 | \$7,350.00 | \$8.00 | \$8,400.00 | | |
| 17 | COMPACTED AGGREGATE SHOULDER | CY | 175 | \$75.00 | \$13,125.00 | \$63.00 | \$11,025.00 | | |
| 18 | MONUMENT BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE | EACH | 3 | \$475.00 | \$1,425.00 | \$900.00 | \$2,700.00 | | |
| 19 | MISCELLANEOUS METALS | LBS | 500 | \$1.35 | \$675.00 | \$1.10 | \$550.00 | | |
| 20 | REMOVAL, REPLACEMENT AND RE-ERECTION OF GROUND MOUNTED SIGNS | LUMP | 1 | \$2,750.00 | \$2,750.00 | \$2,500.00 | \$2,500.00 | | |
| 21 | REMOVE AND REPLACE EXISTING LOOP DETECTORS | LUMP | 1 | \$2,100.00 | \$2,100.00 | \$3,000.00 | \$3,000.00 | | |
| 22 | PAVEMENT MARKINGS | LUMP | 1 | \$2,275.00 | \$2,275.00 | \$3,800.00 | \$3,800.00 | | |
| 23 | MAIL BOX SUPPORT SYSTEM, SINGLE | EACH | 45 | \$75.00 | \$3,375.00 | \$100.00 | \$4,500.00 | | |
| 24 | GENERAL CONSTRUCTION CONTINGENCY ALLOWANCE | LUMP | 1 | \$19,000.00 | \$19,000.00 | \$19,000.00 | \$19,000.00 | | |
| 25 | CONSTRUCTION STAKING ALLOWANCE | LUMP | 1 | \$3,000.00 | \$3,000.00 | \$3,000.00 | \$3,000.00 | | |
| 26 | INSPECTION ALLOWANCE | LUMP | 1 | \$18,000.00 | \$18,000.00 | \$18,000.00 | \$18,000.00 | | |
| TOTAL PROJECT COST | | | | TOTAL | \$372,096.00 | TOTAL | \$386,626.75 | | |
| | | | | DAYS TO COMPLETE: 45 DAYS | | DAYS TO COMPLETE: 45 CALENDAR DAYS | | | |
| | | | | EARLIEST START DATE: JUNE 3, 2019 | | EARLIEST START DATE: MAY 20, 2019 | | | |

| | | CARRON ASPHALT PAVING, INC. | | | BARBICAS CONSTRUCTION CO., INC. | | |
|---------------------------|---|-----------------------------|-------|-------------------------------|---------------------------------|----------------------------------|---------------------|
| | DESCRIPTION | UNIT | QTY. | UNIT PRICE | TOTAL PRICE | UNIT PRICE | TOTAL PRICE |
| 1 | LINEAR GRADING | LF | 4,711 | \$5.50 | \$25,910.50 | \$1.50 | \$7,066.50 |
| 2 | PARTIAL DEPTH ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPAIR | SY | 710 | \$19.00 | \$13,490.00 | \$22.00 | \$15,620.00 |
| 3 | CONCRETE DRIVE REMOVAL AND ASPHALT REPLACEMENT | SY | 125 | \$25.00 | \$3,125.00 | \$70.00 | \$8,750.00 |
| 4 | FULL DEPTH ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPAIR | SY | 1,425 | \$50.00 | \$71,250.00 | \$48.00 | \$68,400.00 |
| 5 | PAVEMENT PLANING, ASPHALT CONCRETE | SY | 7,120 | \$3.25 | \$23,140.00 | \$5.00 | \$35,600.00 |
| 6 | PAVEMENT PLANING, PORTLAND CEMENT CONCRETE | SY | 123 | \$3.25 | \$399.75 | \$7.00 | \$861.00 |
| 7 | SUBGRADE REMOVAL AND REPLACEMENT | CY | 475 | \$45.00 | \$21,375.00 | \$45.00 | \$21,375.00 |
| 8 | CONCRETE PAVEMENT REMOVAL AND REPAIR, CLASS QC MS | SY | 115 | \$120.00 | \$13,800.00 | \$125.00 | \$14,375.00 |
| 9 | ODOT 441, ASPHALT CONCRETE SURFACE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22 (2" DEPTH) | CY | 400 | \$195.00 | \$78,000.00 | \$230.00 | \$92,000.00 |
| 10 | ODOT 441, ASPHALT CONCRETE INTERMEDIATE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22 (3/4" LEVELING) | CY | 150 | \$185.00 | \$27,750.00 | \$240.00 | \$36,000.00 |
| 11 | WALK REMOVED AND REPLACED WITH CONCRETE CURB RAMP | SF | 200 | \$15.00 | \$3,000.00 | \$13.00 | \$2,600.00 |
| 12 | CONCRETE CURB REMOVED AND REPLACED (CONCRETE CURB, TYPE 3-A) | LF | 60 | \$35.00 | \$2,100.00 | \$30.00 | \$1,800.00 |
| 13 | MANHOLE ADJUST TO GRADE | EACH | 4 | \$750.00 | \$3,000.00 | \$490.00 | \$1,960.00 |
| 14 | VALVE BOX ADJUST TO GRADE | EACH | 4 | \$550.00 | \$2,200.00 | \$349.50 | \$1,398.00 |
| 15 | MAINTENANCE OF TRAFFIC | LUMP | 1 | \$42,000.00 | \$42,000.00 | \$50,000.00 | \$50,000.00 |
| 16 | SHOULDER PREPARATION | SY | 1,050 | \$5.00 | \$5,250.00 | \$6.00 | \$6,300.00 |
| 17 | COMPACTED AGGREGATE SHOULDER | CY | 175 | \$75.00 | \$13,125.00 | \$80.00 | \$14,000.00 |
| 18 | MONUMENT BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE | EACH | 3 | \$600.00 | \$1,800.00 | \$504.50 | \$1,513.50 |
| 19 | MISCELLANEOUS METALS | LBS | 500 | \$1.25 | \$625.00 | \$1.65 | \$825.00 |
| 20 | REMOVAL, REPLACEMENT AND RE-ERECTION OF GROUND MOUNTED SIGNS | LUMP | 1 | \$2,500.00 | \$2,500.00 | \$2,500.00 | \$2,500.00 |
| 21 | REMOVE AND REPLACE EXISTING LOOP DETECTORS | LUMP | 1 | \$3,000.00 | \$3,000.00 | \$3,000.00 | \$3,000.00 |
| 22 | PAVEMENT MARKINGS | LUMP | 1 | \$3,800.00 | \$3,800.00 | \$3,800.00 | \$3,800.00 |
| 23 | MAIL BOX SUPPORT SYSTEM, SINGLE | EACH | 45 | \$55.00 | \$2,475.00 | \$180.00 | \$8,100.00 |
| 24 | GENERAL CONSTRUCTION CONTINGENCY ALLOWANCE | LUMP | 1 | \$19,000.00 | \$19,000.00 | \$19,000.00 | \$19,000.00 |
| 25 | CONSTRUCTION STAKING ALLOWANCE | LUMP | 1 | \$3,000.00 | \$3,000.00 | \$3,000.00 | \$3,000.00 |
| 26 | INSPECTION ALLOWANCE | LUMP | 1 | \$18,000.00 | \$18,000.00 | \$18,000.00 | \$18,000.00 |
| TOTAL PROJECT COST | | | | TOTAL | \$403,115.25 | TOTAL | \$437,844.00 |
| | | | | DAYS TO COMPLETE: 50-55 | | DAYS TO COMPLETE: 60 DAYS | |
| | | | | EARLIEST START DATE: 6/1/2019 | | EARLIEST START DATE: MAY 1, 2019 | |

| SPECIALIZED CONSTRUCTION, INC. | | | | | | |
|-----------------------------------|---|------|-------|--------------|---------------------|--|
| | DESCRIPTION | UNIT | QTY. | UNIT PRICE | TOTAL PRICE | |
| 1 | LINEAR GRADING | LF | 4,711 | \$5.50 | \$25,910.50 | |
| 2 | PARTIAL DEPTH ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPAIR | SY | 710 | \$45.00 | \$31,950.00 | |
| 3 | CONCRETE DRIVE REMOVAL AND ASPHALT REPLACEMENT | SY | 125 | \$18.30 | \$2,287.50 | |
| 4 | FULL DEPTH ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPAIR | SY | 1,425 | \$75.00 | \$106,875.00 | |
| 5 | PAVEMENT PLANING, ASPHALT CONCRETE | SY | 7,120 | \$5.00 | \$35,600.00 | |
| 6 | PAVEMENT PLANING, PORTLAND CEMENT CONCRETE | SY | 123 | \$5.00 | \$615.00 | |
| 7 | SUBGRADE REMOVAL AND REPLACEMENT | CY | 475 | \$75.00 | \$35,625.00 | |
| 8 | CONCRETE PAVEMENT REMOVAL AND REPAIR, CLASS QC MS | SY | 115 | \$105.00 | \$12,075.00 | |
| 9 | ODOT 441, ASPHALT CONCRETE SURFACE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22 (2" DEPTH) | CY | 400 | \$220.00 | \$88,000.00 | |
| 10 | ODOT 441, ASPHALT CONCRETE INTERMEDIATE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22 (3/4" LEVELING) | CY | 150 | \$210.00 | \$31,500.00 | |
| 11 | WALK REMOVED AND REPLACED WITH CONCRETE CURB RAMP | SF | 200 | \$25.00 | \$5,000.00 | |
| 12 | CONCRETE CURB REMOVED AND REPLACED (CONCRETE CURB, TYPE 3-A) | LF | 60 | \$75.00 | \$4,500.00 | |
| 13 | MANHOLE ADJUST TO GRADE | EACH | 4 | \$750.00 | \$3,000.00 | |
| 14 | VALVE BOX ADJUST TO GRADE | EACH | 4 | \$500.00 | \$2,000.00 | |
| 15 | MAINTENANCE OF TRAFFIC | LUMP | 1 | \$22,000.00 | \$22,000.00 | |
| 16 | SHOULDER PREPARATION | SY | 1,050 | \$7.00 | \$7,350.00 | |
| 17 | COMPACTED AGGREGATE SHOULDER | CY | 175 | \$100.00 | \$17,500.00 | |
| 18 | MONUMENT BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE | EACH | 3 | \$500.00 | \$1,500.00 | |
| 19 | MISCELLANEOUS METALS | LBS | 500 | \$1.50 | \$750.00 | |
| 20 | REMOVAL, REPLACEMENT AND RE-ERECTION OF GROUND MOUNTED SIGNS | LUMP | 1 | \$2,500.00 | \$2,500.00 | |
| 21 | REMOVE AND REPLACE EXISTING LOOP DETECTORS | LUMP | 1 | \$3,000.00 | \$3,000.00 | |
| 22 | PAVEMENT MARKINGS | LUMP | 1 | \$3,800.00 | \$3,800.00 | |
| 23 | MAIL BOX SUPPORT SYSTEM, SINGLE | EACH | 45 | \$200.00 | \$9,000.00 | |
| 24 | GENERAL CONSTRUCTION CONTINGENCY ALLOWANCE | LUMP | 1 | \$19,000.00 | \$19,000.00 | |
| 25 | CONSTRUCTION STAKING ALLOWANCE | LUMP | 1 | \$3,000.00 | \$3,000.00 | |
| 26 | INSPECTION ALLOWANCE | LUMP | 1 | \$18,000.00 | \$18,000.00 | |
| TOTAL PROJECT COST | | | | TOTAL | \$492,338.00 | |
| DAYS TO COMPLETE: 45 | | | | | | |
| EARLIEST START DATE: MAY 31, 2019 | | | | | | |